Research Evaluation Analysis Process Chart

Name of Ancestor : John Smith Types of Records Searched: Vital, Church, Census, Family, Cemetery, Obit, Military

Fact that we want to prove: Date of birth Theory : John Smith was born 14 Feb 1821

Record Type	Source Type Original or Derivative or Authored	Information Type Primary Secondary Undetermined	Evidence Type Direct Indirect Negative	Value of Fact Date, Place, etc	Created when Date the record was created	# of Yrs after The event it was created	Why was it created and Who created it	Does it support the theory	Analysis
Family Record	Original Image	Secondary	Direct	14 Feb 1821	1962	141	Genealogy By Grand-daughter	Yes	Theory start
Family Search Death Index	Derivative Index	Secondary	Direct	14 Feb 1819 Estimated	2010	191	Genealogy	No	No support Made a # of years after event Derivative source
Family Search Death Certificate image	Original Image	Birth information was 3rd hand information	Direct	14 Feb 1821	1904	83	Government Record	Yes	Supports Official Gov Rec But # of yrs 3rd hand info
Obit	Original image	Undetermined	Direct	14 Feb 1819	1904	85	Newspaper Notice of death	No	No support Made # Yrs after Undetermined informant
Grave	Original photo	Undetermined	Direct	14 Feb 1824	1904	80	Cemetery Marker	No	No support Made # Yrs after Undetermined informant
Church Record of Members	Original	Undetermined	Direct	14 Feb 1819	Unknown	?	Church Records, Church Pastor	No	No support Undetermined informant Unknown when created
Military Pension	Original image	Secondary, Parts maybe Primary	Direct	14 Feb 1821	1888	67	Gov Record Military Pension	Yes	Supports John gave info of birth

Record Type	Source Type Original or Derivative or Authored	Information Type Primary Secondary Undetermined	Evidence Type Direct Indirect Negative	Value of Fact Date, Place, etc	Created when Date the record was created	# of Yrs after The event it was created	Why was it created and Who created it	Does it support the theory	Analysis
1900 Census	Original image	Undetermined	In direct	1819	1900	81	Gov Record	No	No support Indirect No date – figured year Undetermined informant.
1880	Original image	Undetermined	In direct	1821	1880	59	Gov Record	Yes	Supports but Indirect No date – figured year Undetermined informant.
1870	Original image	Undetermined	In direct	1824	1870	46	Gov Record	No	No support Indirect No date – figured year Undetermined informant.
1860	Original image	Undetermined	In direct	1820	1860	40	Gov Record	No	No support Indirect No date – figured year Undetermined informant.
1850	Original image	Undetermined	In direct	1821	1850	31	Gov Record	Yes	supports Indirect No date – figured year Undetermined informant.
1820	Original image	Undetermined	Negative	0	1820	0	Gov Record	Yes	John Smith does not appear in 1820 as a child of his parents, Therefore it is possible he was not born yet.

Record Type	Source Type Original or Derivative or Authored	Information Type Primary Secondary Undetermined	Evidence Type Direct Indirect Negative	Value of Fact Date, Place, etc	Created when Date the record was created	# of Yrs after The event it was created	Why was it created and Who created it	Does it support the theory	Analysis
Church Record of Membership	Original image	Secondary	Direct	14 Feb 1821	1844	23	Church Record	Yes	Supports 2nd oldest record Secondary informant

Conclusion: I conclude that John Smith was born on 14 Feb 1821 based upon the earliest records created (cite the 1844 church record, the 1820 census and 1850 census) and based upon the Military pension file since it included a form with his date of birth, address and wife's name, and a signature of John Smith all on the same page, in the same ink, with what looked like the same hand writing making this form possibly primary information. (Cite the source of the pension file).

Other census records were not considered as they were created by undetermined informant, several years after the birth event and are indirect evidence of birth Year.

Contradictory evidence (Church Record of Members, Grave marker, Obituary, Family Search Death Index) was not considered because of inconsistency, undetermined informant, derivative source type, number of years created after the birth event and one source of unknown creation.

While the Death Certificate and Family Record directly answers our question of John Smith birth date, and both are in support of our theory that John Smith was born on 14 Feb 1821, they are second and third hand information, created many years after the birth event and therefore used only as our Theory Start position and secondary support.